

# APPENDIX A

## Objections by N. Albert Bacharach

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>In re MCI Phone Rate Litigation</i> (S.D. Ill., No. 99-cv-01275)	Ronald K. Weintraub	N/A	3/27/2001	Overruled	5/18/2001	Unknown	
<i>Meyenburg v. Exxon Mobil Corporation</i> (S.D. Ill., No. 05-cv-00015)	Melissa Nolett; Paul Redd; Brenda Matthews; Thomas Schultz	William F. Kopis; Paul S. Rothstein; Edward W. Cochran; Frank H. Tomlinson	8/15/2005	Held untimely	6/30/2006	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>In re Trans Union Corp. Privacy Litigation</i> (N.D. Ill., No. 00-cv-04729)	Julius Dunmore; Robert Falkner; Michael Rinis; Babette Rinis; David T. Murray; Devern Wilson	John Pentz; Edward W. Cochran; Paul S. Rothstein; Charles B. Zuravin	8/27/2008	Overruled	10/10/2008	Voluntarily dismissed	Bacharach originally represented Dunmore only, but moved to dismiss appeal on behalf of several objectors also represented by serial objector counsel.
<i>In re Mattel Inc. Toy Lead Paint Products Liability Litigation</i> (C.D. Cal., No. 07-ml-01897)	Jennifer Deachin	Michael D. Luppi	3/8/2010	Overruled	N/A	N/A	At fairness hearing, the district court described objection as "frivolous."
<i>In re TFT-LCD (Flat Panel) Antitrust Litigation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 07-md-01827)	Keena Dale	N/A	10/9/2012	Overruled	6/13/2013	Voluntarily dismissed	Plaintiffs filed charts of objections submitted by Bacharach, Cochran, and Pentz.  Bacharach was accused of ghostwriting <i>pro se</i> objection by repeat client Julius Dunmore, which bore a Gainesville, FL stamp.
<i>Fraley v. Facebook</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 11-cv-01726)	Jennifer Deachin	Alan J. Sherwood	5/2/2013	Overruled	10/29/2013	Voluntarily dismissed	Bacharach did not appear until appeal. Notice of appeal was untimely, leading to voluntary dismissal.
<i>Tennille v. Western Union Company</i> (D. Colo., No. 09-cv-00938)	Self	Paul S. Rothstein	5/20/2013	Overruled	10/15/2014	Voluntarily dismissed	Objection originally filed <i>pro se</i> before admission to Colorado bar.
<i>Malta v. The Federal Home Loan Mortgage Corporation</i> (S.D. Cal., No. 10-cv-01290)	Julius Dunmore	Michael D. Luppi; David Hall	6/5/2013	Overruled	7/8/2013	Voluntarily dismissed	Appeal voluntarily dismissed before district court ruled on post-judgment motion for permission to conduct discovery on Bacharach and client.

## Objections by N. Albert Bacharach

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>Fladell v. Wells Fargo Bank</i> (S.D. Fla., No. 13-cv-60721)	Jennifer Deachin n/k/a Jennifer Hinjosa	N/A	8/19/2014	Overruled	11/19/2014	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>In re Capital One Telephone Consumer Protection Act Litigation</i> (N.D. Ill., No. 12-cv-10064)	Devera R.D. Bartte	Thomas C. Cronin	10/27/2014	Overruled	3/23/2015	Voluntarily dismissed	Bartte's objection filed by Cronin, who signed as "One of her Attorneys," but Bacharach did not appear until appeal.
<i>Soto v. The Gallup Organization, Inc.</i> (S.D. Fla., No. 13-cv-61747)	Cathy Scarberry; Dave Scarberry	N/A	11/13/2015	Overruled	12/1/2015	Voluntarily dismissed	Appeal voluntarily dismissed before the district court ruled on post-judgment motion for leave to take discovery of objector.
<i>Hendricks v. StarKist Co.</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 13-cv-00729)	Jemea Graham; Julius Dunmore; Valerie Williford	Alan J. Sherwood	11/20/2015	Overruled	10/28/2016	Ongoing	Bacharach did not appear until appeal.
<i>Perkins v. LinkedIn Corporation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 13-cv-04303)	Daniel Brown; Jenny Hill	Alan J. Sherwood	12/14/2015	Overruled	3/4/2016	Voluntarily dismissed	Bacharach did not appear until appeal.
<i>In re Automatic Parts Antitrust Litigation</i> (E.D. Mich., No. 12-md-02311)	Carlene Cross; Albert Graham, Jr.	N/A	4/11/2016	Withdrawn	N/A	N/A	Objection withdrawn after magistrate rejected attempt to quash subpoena for depositions of Bacharach and client.
<i>Mehigan v. Ascena Retail Group</i> (E.D. Pa., No. 15-cv-00724)	Leah Harrington; Beth Yoes; Leighan Sonnier	Paul A. Lawless	4/20/2016	Overruled	8/26/2016	Dismissed for failure to prosecute	Bacharach did not appear until appeal. Appeal closed for failure to file opening forms. Bacharach claimed in motion to reopen appeal that he had been "recently appointed," but Plaintiffs-Appellees pointed out that objection in district court filed using Bacharach's ECF login. Motion to reopen appeal denied.
<i>In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Marketing, Sales Practices</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 15-md-02672)	Greg R. Siewert; Scott Siewert	N/A	9/16/2016	Overruled	11/23/2016	Ongoing	
<i>In re Takata Airbag Products Liability Litigation</i> (S.D. Fla., No. 14-cv-24009)	Olga Seltzer	N/A	2/5/2018	Overruled	3/23/2018	Ongoing	

## Objections by N. Albert Bacharach

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>In re Lithium Ion Batteries Antitrust Litigation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 13-md-02420)	Rinis Travel Service, Inc.	Alan J. Sherwood	3/1/2018	Withdrawn	N/A	N/A	Bacharach and objector found in civil contempt of order for objector to appear for deposition. Unprepared 30(b)(6) representative for objector was Bacharach's sister. Bacharach was forced to disclose all objections from objector in past five years and any compensation received in connection with those objections. Bacharach and objector reprimanded and cautioned. Bacharach and objector withdrew objection and waived right to appeal.
<i>In re Allstate Fair Credit Reporting Act Litigation</i> (M.D. Tenn., No. 02-md-1457)	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Overruled	Unknown	Unknown	Bacharach appeared at fairness hearing on 7/18/2005 and admitted to having filed objections in other cases "greater than 25 times easily . . . and probably less than 100 over the last five years."
<i>In re Insurance Brokerage Antitrust Litigation</i> (D.N.J., No. 04-cv-5185)	Self	Unknown	Unknown	Overruled	Unknown	Unknown	Bacharach's objection was not found on the public docket. It was addressed by the district court in the opinion granting final approval. 282 F.R.D. 92 (2012).

## Objections by John Pentz

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>Meyenburg v. Exxon Mobil Corporation</i> (S.D. Ill., No. 05-cv-00015)	David Pentz; Guy Thrasher	J. Scott Kessinger	8/8/2005	Overruled	7/1/2006	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>Barnes v. Fleet National Bank</i> (D. Mass., No. 01-cv-10395)	Nancy Feldman	N/A	10/25/2005	Overruled	7/14/2006	Voluntarily dismissed	Objector was Pentz's mother-in-law. District court imposed an appeal bond of \$645,111.60.
<i>In re Royal Ahold N.V. Securities &amp; ERISA Litigation</i> (D. Md., No. 03-md-01539)	Linda Tsai	N/A	5/3/2006	Overruled	N/A	N/A	Pentz solicited objector after she filed <i>pro se</i> and amended objection significantly. The district court said he "hijacked" her objection and that "it seems to me that he has introduced what I could readily call a frivolous objection at a very late stage in this case."
<i>Lockwood v. Certegy Check Services, Inc.</i> (M.D. Fla., No. 07-cv-01434)	Joel M. Shapiro	David M. Snyder	8/4/2008	Withdrawn	N/A	N/A	Objector was withdrawn the day after the court denied his motion for a protective order to bar his deposition.
<i>Fresco v. R.L. Polk &amp; Co.</i> (S.D. Fla., No. 07-cv-60695)	Jacqueline Pio; Anthony Pio	Nicolas J. Gutierrez, Jr.	10/8/2009	Overruled	8/20/2010	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>In re Lawn Mower Engine Horsepower Marketing &amp; Sales Practices Litigation</i> (E.D. Wis., No. 08-md-1999)	Carl Olson, Jr.	N/A	6/7/2010	Overruled	9/10/2010	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>Dewey v. Volkswagen AG</i> (D.N.J., No. 2:07-cv-02361)	David T. Murray; Jennifer B. Murray; James E. Pentz	Vincent S. Verdiramo	6/15/2010	Overruled	8/20/2010	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>In re Lifelock Inc. Marketing &amp; Sales Practices Litigation</i> (D. Ariz., No. 08-md-01977)	James E. Pentz	N/A	7/9/2010	Overruled	9/24/2010	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>Blessing v. Sirius XM Radio Inc.</i> (S.D.N.Y., No. 09-cv-10035)	Lange M. Thomas	Eric S. Horowitz	7/19/2011	Overruled	N/A	N/A	
<i>In re TFT-LCD (Flat Panel) Antitrust Litigation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 07-md-01827)	Barbara Cochran; Kevin Luke	George W. Cochran	4/17/2012	Overruled	5/20/2013	Voluntarily dismissed	Objector Kevin Luke stated in deposition that he was not represented by Pentz and that his objection was supplied by counsel.

## Objections by John Pentz

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>Hitch Enterprises, Inc. v. Cimarex Energy Co.</i> (W.D. Okla., No. 11-cv-00013)	Katherine Riesen Lathrop	Stephen C. Griffiths	2/14/2013	Withdrawn	N/A	N/A	Objection withdrawn after plaintiffs moved for sanctions and to sever the lone objector's claim from the settlement fund.
<i>In re Citigroup Inc. Bond Litigation</i> (S.D.N.Y., No. 08-cv-09522)	Lexie L. Hopson; Michelle B. Hopson	Vincent S. Verdiramo	6/26/2013	Overruled	1/14/2014	Voluntarily dismissed	Pentz did not appear until appeal.
<i>In re Merck &amp; Co. Vytarin/Zetia Securities Litigation</i> (D.N.J., No. 08-cv-02177)	Franklin DeJulius	Vincent S. Verdiramo	8/5/2013	Overruled	10/25/2013	Voluntarily dismissed	The district court set appeal bond at \$50,000 to be paid jointly by three objectors.
<i>Poertner v. The Gillette Co.</i> (M.D. Fla., No. 12-cv-00803)	Robert Falkner	Brian M. Silverio	2/28/2014	Overruled	9/15/2014	Judgment affirmed	Pentz did not appear until appeal.
<i>In re Dynamic Random Access Memory (DRAM) Antitrust Litigation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 02-md-01486)	Barbara Cochran; James Glase; Bryan Marcus	George W. Cochran; Edward W. Cochran	5/5/2014	Overruled	7/7/2014	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>In re Capital One Telephone Consumer Protection Act Litigation</i> (N.D. Ill., No. 12-cv-10064)	Krystal L. Nykaza (nee Snyder)	N/A	10/24/2014	Overruled	N/A	N/A	
<i>Gehrich v. Chase USA, N.A.</i> (N.D. Ill., No. 12-cv-05510)	David Schlagel	N/A	2/8/2015	Overruled	4/1/2015	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>Demmick v. Celco Partnership</i> (D.N.J., No. 06-cv-2163)	Nancy C. Corser	Vincent S. Verdiramo	2/24/2015	Overruled	5/22/2015	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>Wright v. Nationstar Mortgage LLC</i> (N.D. Ill., No. 14-cv-10457)	Connie Pentz	Arthur J. Howe	4/4/2016	Overruled	9/27/2016	Voluntarily dismissed	Objector was Pentz's mother.
<i>In re Pfizer Securities Litigation</i> (S.D.N.Y., No. 04-cv-9866)	Ernest J. Browne; Scott Browne	Vincent S. Verdiramo	11/28/2016	Overruled	1/20/2017	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>Dorado v. Bank of America, N.A.</i> (S.D. Fla., No. 16-cv-21147)	David McBride	N/A	2/7/2017	Overruled	4/21/2017	Voluntarily dismissed	Pentz did not appear until appeal.
<i>In re Takata Airbag Products Liability Litigation</i> (S.D. Fla., No. 14-cv-24009)	Jeffrey Bernstein; Robert Falkner; Katherine Falkner; Gary Maggard; Charles F. Breese; Mary Beth Breese	Edward W. Cochran; Brian M. Silverio	9/22/2017	Overruled	11/20/2017	Ongoing	

## Objections by John Pentz

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>Fraley v. Facebook</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 11-cv-01726)	Wendy Lally; Alec Greenhouse; Jonathan Bobak; Zachary Cochran	N/A	Unknown (not available on PACER)	Overruled	9/24/2013	Judgment affirmed	
<i>In re "A Million Little Piece" Litigation</i> (S.D.N.Y., No. 06-md-01771)	Connie Pentz	N/A	Unknown (not available on PACER)	Withdrawn	N/A	N/A	Objector was Pentz's mother.

Note: More objections filed by John Pentz can be found in an appendix filed by plaintiffs in *In re TFT-LCD (Flat Panel) Antitrust Litigation* (N.D. Cal., No. 07-md-01827), which is provided here as Appendix B

## Objections by Vincent S. Verdiramo

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>Dewey v. Volkswagen AG</i> (D.N.J., No. 2:07-cv-02361)	Paul M. Kaufman; David T. Murray;	John Pentz; Edward F. Siegel	6/14/2010; 6/15/2010	Overruled	8/20/2010	Voluntarily dismissed	Verdiramo represented two
<i>In re Merck &amp; Co. Vytarin/Zetia Securities Litigation</i> (D.N.J., No. 08-cv-02177)	Franklin DeJulius	John Pentz	8/5/2013	Overruled	10/25/2013	Voluntarily dismissed	The district court set appeal bond at \$50,000 to be paid jointly by three objectors.
<i>Demmick v. Cellco Partnership</i> (D.N.J., No. 06-cv-2163)	Nancy C. Corser	John Pentz	2/24/2015	Overruled	5/22/2015	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>In re Pfizer Securities Litigation</i> (S.D.N.Y., No. 04-	Ernest J. Browne; Scott Browne	John Pentz	11/28/2016	Overruled	1/20/2017	Voluntarily dismissed	



## Objections by George W. Cochran

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>In re TFT-LCD (Flat Panel) Antitrust Litigation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 07-md-01827)	Geri Maxwell; Maria Marshall; Wayne Marshall; Gerri Marshall	N/A	4/8/2012	Overruled	5/20/2013	Voluntarily dismissed	Three objectors withdrew their objections, and the deposition of remaining objector revealed serious issues with her standing to object.
<i>In re Toyota Motor Corp. Unintended Acceleration Mktng. Sales Prac. &amp; Prods. Liab. Litigation</i> (C.D. Cal., No. 10-ML-02151)	Amelia Ranieri; Housan Huang	N/A	5/13/2013	Overruled	8/22/2013	Voluntarily dismissed	
<i>Pappas v. Naked Juice Co. of Glendora, Inc.</i> (C.D. Cal., No. 11-cv-08276)	Bradley L. Henry; Sarah Marie Henry	N/A	11/11/2013	Overruled	2/21/2014	Voluntarily dismissed	Objection originally filed <i>pro se</i> . Cochran appeared after notice of appeal filed.
<i>Gollogher v. Todd Christopher International, Inc.</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 14-15890)	Jennifer Lynn Cochran	N/A	2/7/2014	Overruled	5/21/2014	Voluntarily dismissed	Objection originally filed <i>pro se</i> . Notice of appeal filed with Cochran's ECF login, but Cochran did not appear until afterwards.
<i>In re Dynamic Random Access Memory (DRAM) Antitrust Litigation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 02-md-01486)	Barbara S. Cochran; James Glase; Bryan Marcus	John Pentz; Edward W. Cochran	5/5/2014	Overruled	7/7/2014	Voluntarily dismissed	Cochran did not appear until appeal.
<i>Volz v. The Coca Cola Co.</i> (S.D. Ohio, No. 10-cv-00879)	Bradley L. Henry; Wanda J. Cochran	N/A	10/31/2014	Overruled	N/A	N/A	
<i>Demmick v. Cellco Partnership</i> (D.N.J., No. 06-cv-2163)	Wanda J. Cochran	N/A	2/17/2015	Overruled	5/22/2015	Voluntarily dismissed	Objection originally filed <i>pro se</i> . Cochran did not appear until appeal.
<i>In re Cathode Ray Tube (CRT) Litigation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 07-cv-5944)	Josie Saik	N/A	10/24/2015	Overruled	8/5/2016	Ongoing	Objection originally filed <i>pro se</i> .
<i>Perkins v. LinkedIn Corporation</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 13-cv-04303)	Olen York	N/A	12/30/2015	Overruled	3/10/2016	Voluntarily dismissed	The court found that objector was not a member of the class.  Objection originally filed <i>pro se</i> . Cochran appeared after notice of appeal filed.
<i>In re Blue Buffalo Co., Ltd. Marketing &amp; Sales Practices Litigation</i> (E.D. Mo., No. 14-md-02562)	Pamela McCoy	N/A	4/12/2016	Overruled	7/13/2016	Judgment affirmed	Cochran did not appear until appeal.
<i>Mehigan v. Ascena Retail Group</i> (E.D. Pa., No. 15-cv-00724)	Vicki Mager; Melissa Schultz	N/A	4/29/2016	Overruled	8/26/2016	Voluntarily dismissed	Cochran did not appear until appeal.

## Objections by George W. Cochran

Case	Client(s)	Additional Counsel	Date of Objection	Outcome of Objection	Date of Appeal	Outcome of Appeal	Comments
<i>In re Automatic Parts Antitrust Litigation</i> (E.D. Mich., No. 12-md-02311)	Olen York; Amy York; Nancy York	N/A	5/9/2016	Overruled	7/6/2016	Voluntarily dismissed	Cochran barred from arguing at fairness hearing because he was not admitted to practice in the Eastern District of Michigan.
<i>Ebarle v. LifeLock, Inc.</i> (N.D. Cal., No. 15-cv-00258)	Barbara S. Cochran	N/A	5/9/2016	Overruled	10/18/2016	Voluntarily dismissed	Cochran did not appear until appeal.
<i>In re Takata Airbag Products Liability Litigation</i> (S.D. Fla., No. 14-cv-24009)	Pamela McCoy	N/A	9/26/2017	Overruled	11/20/2017	Ongoing	